



**Mayor**

Dee Margo

**City Council**

*District 1*

Peter Svarzbein

*District 2*

Alexsandra Annello

*District 3*

Cassandra Hernandez

*District 4*

Sam Morgan

*District 5*

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*

Claudia Ordaz Perez

*District 7*

Henry Rivera

*District 8*

Cissy Lizarraga

**City Manager**

Tommy Gonzalez

**HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES**

**FIRST FLOOR, COUNCIL CHAMBERS**

**CITY 1 BUILDING, 300 N. CAMPBELL STREET**

**NOVEMBER 19, 2018, 4:00 P.M.**

The El Paso Historic Landmark Commission held a public hearing in the Council Chambers, City 1 Building, 300 N. Campbell Street, November 19, 2018, 4:00 p.m.

The following Commissioners were present: 9

Chairman D.J. Sevigny

Vice-Chairman Vicki Hamilton

Commissioner Chris Esper

Commissioner Sherry Mowles

Commissioner Stapler

Commissioner Don Luciano

Commissioner Robert Palacios

Commissioner Francisco Macias (arrived 4:05)

Commissioner Ivan Lopez

Commissioners not present: 0

Vacancy: 0

The following City staff members were present:

Ms. Providencia Velázquez, Historic Preservation Officer, Planning & Inspections

Mr. Russell Abeln, Assistant City Attorney, City Attorney's office

**CALL TO ORDER**

Chairman Sevigny called the meeting to order at 4:02 p.m.

**CALL TO THE PUBLIC**

Chairman Sevigny asked if anyone present would like to address the Commission on issues not posted on the agenda. *No response from the audience.*

**CHANGES TO THE AGENDA**

*No changes to the agenda.*



<b>1. PHAP18-00041</b>	99 Government Hill 18 & 19 & Pt of 20 & 21 (78.65 Ft. on S – 141.85 Ft on W – 55.08 Ft on N – 140 Ft on E) (11733.81 Sq. Ft.), City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas
Location:	4523 Trowbridge Drive
Historic District:	Austin Terrace
Property Owner:	Adolfo and Mary Sanchez
Representative:	Adolfo and Mary Sanchez
Representative District:	2
Existing Zoning:	R-4/H (Residential/Historic)
Year Built:	1922
Historic Status:	Contributing
Request:	Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a pergola at the rear façade
Application Filed:	10/22/18
45 Day Expiration:	12/06/18

Ms. Velázquez gave a presentation and responded to comments and questions from Commissioners.

Ms. Velázquez read the following recommendations into the record:

*The Historic Preservation Office recommends **APPROVAL WITH A MODIFICATION** of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:*

*The Design Guidelines for El Paso's Historic Districts, Sites, and Properties recommend the following:*

- *Site features that may exist on a property are swimming pools, pergolas, terraces and gardens and every effort should be made to retain those features that remain.*
- *Place non-traditional site features such as swimming pools, playground equipment, concrete pads and basketball goals, tree houses, dumpsters, and trash receptacles only in areas such as rear yards, where they are not visible from the street.*
- *New additions should be designed and constructed so that the character-defining features of the historic building are not radically changed, obscured, damaged or destroyed in the process of rehabilitation.*
- *Any new addition should be planned so that it is constructed to the rear of the property or on a non-character defining elevation and is minimally visible from the public right-of-way.*
- *Introduce additions in locations that are not visible from the street-generally on rear elevations.*



- *Locate additions carefully so they do not damage or conceal significant building features or details.*
- *Design an addition so it is compatible in roof form, proportions, materials and details with the existing structure.*
- *Design an addition that is compatible with but subtly different from existing historic homes in the district.*
- *Design an addition so that if removed in the future, the historic building's form and character defining features are not obscured, damaged, or destroyed.*

*The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation recommend the following:*

- *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.*
- *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property.*

**THE MODIFICATION IS THAT THE COVERED ROOFING BE REMOVED AND THE STRUCTURE REMAIN OPEN.**

Chairman Sevigny, Vice-Chairwoman Hamilton and Commissioners Mowles and Esper made remarks and asked questions of the property owner and contractor.

Adolfo Sanchez, property owner, commented and responded to questions from Commissioners.

Walter Garcia, contractor, commented and responded to questions from Commissioners.

Russell Abeln, Assistant City Attorney, made remarks.

**MOTION:**

Motion made by Chairman Sevigny, seconded by Commissioner Stapler **AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THIS ITEM WITH THE FOLLOWING MODIFICATION:**

**REPOSITION THE SUPPORT POSTS TO ALIGN WITH THE COVERED PORTION OF THE PERGOLA.**



<b>2. PHAP18-00018</b>	83 Government Hill 23 & 24 (8250 sq. ft.), City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas
Location:	4408 Leeds Avenue
Historic District:	Austin Terrace
Property Owner:	Miguel and Lydia Fuentes
Representative:	Miguel and Lydia Fuentes
Representative District:	2
Existing Zoning:	R-4/H (Residential/Historic)
Year Built:	1950
Historic Status:	Non-Contributing
Request:	Reconsideration of an approved Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal of eight casement windows and replacement with vinyl slider windows
Application Filed:	Original filing date – 05/07/18
45 Day Expiration:	Original expiration date – 06/14/18

Ms. Velázquez gave a presentation and responded to comments and questions from Commissioners. This is a reconsideration, initially before Commissioners in May 2018, of an approved Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal of 8 casement windows and replace with vinyl slider windows.

Ms. Velázquez read the following into the record:

*The Historic Preservation Office recommends **APPROVAL WITH A MODIFICATION** of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:*

*The Design Guidelines for El Paso's Historic Districts, Sites, and Properties recommend the following:*

- *However, if windows are damaged beyond repair, replacement windows should match the type (such as double hung), style (for example six panes over six panes), and finish (paint).*
- *Do not use single pane picture windows or horizontal sliding windows if they are not the original window types.*
- *Retain and preserve original doors and windows, including such elements as sash, glass, sills, lintels, casing, muntins, trim, frames, thresholds, hardware and shutters. If repair of an original window or door element is necessary, repair only the deteriorated element to match the original in size, composition, material, dimension, and detail by patching, splicing, consolidating, or otherwise reinforcing the deteriorated section. The removal of historic materials should be avoided.*



- *When repair is not feasible, door and window products will be reviewed on an individual basis using the following criteria:*
  - a. *Architectural and historical compatibility*
  - b. *Comparison to original profile*
  - c. *Level of significance of original doors and windows to the architectural style of the building.*
  - d. *Three dimensional exterior applied muntins that simulate or match the original muntins may be approved. Single dimension interior applied muntins are not appropriate.*

*The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation recommend the following:*

- *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.*

**THE MODIFICATION IS THAT THE NEW WINDOWS BE CASEMENT WINDOWS TO MATCH THE EXISTING.**

Chairman Sevigny, Vice-Chairwoman Hamilton and Commissioners Palacios, Stapler, Luciano, and Esper commented.

Diana, representing Window World, provided Spanish/English translation for the property owner Ms. Fuentes, responded to comments and questions from Commissioners.

Susie Martinez, representing Window World, responded to comments and questions from Commissioners.

**MOTION:**

Motion made by Vice-Chairwoman Hamilton, seconded by Commissioner Esper **AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ACCEPT IT WITH:**

- 1. WINDOW NUMBER 1 HAVING TWO CASEMENTS WITH A PICTURE IN BETWEEN;**
- 2. WINDOW NUMBER 8 HAVING SLIDERS; AND**
- 3. THE REMAINDER BEING DOUBLE-HUNG.**

**MOTION RESTATED:**

Motion made by Vice-Chairwoman Hamilton, seconded by Commissioner Esper **AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE:**

- 1. WINDOW NUMBER 1 HAVING CASEMENT WINDOWS FLANKING A PICTURE WINDOW;**
- 2. WINDOWS 2 AND 8 BEING SLIDER WINDOWS; AND**
- 3. THE REMAINDER BEING OPERABLE DOUBLE-HUNG SASH WINDOWS.**



3. **PHAP18-00043** 89 Government Hill 31 & 32 (7000 sq. ft.), City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas

Location: 4400 Chester Avenue

Historic District: Austin Terrace

Property Owner: Roberto Carrillo Arteaga

Representative: Roberto Carrillo Arteaga

Representative District: 2

Existing Zoning: R-4/H (Residential/Historic)

Year Built: 1931

Historic Status: Contributing

Request: Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of an addition to the garage

Application Filed: 11/05/18

45 Day Expiration: 12/20/18

Ms. Velázquez gave a presentation and responded to comments and questions from Commissioners.

Ms. Velázquez read the following into the record:

*The Historic Preservation Office recommends **APPROVAL WITH A MODIFICATION** of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:*

*The Design Guidelines for El Paso's Historic Districts, Sites, and Properties recommend the following:*

- *New additions should be designed and constructed so that the character-defining features of the historic building are not radically changed, obscured, damaged or destroyed in the process of rehabilitation.*
- *Any new addition should be planned so that it is constructed to the rear of the property or on a non-character defining elevation and is minimally visible from the public right-of-way.*
- *Introduce additions in locations that are not visible from the street-generally on rear elevations.*
- *Locate additions carefully so they do not damage or conceal significant building features or details.*
- *Design an addition so it is compatible in roof form, proportions materials and details with the existing structure.*
- *Design new buildings and their features to be compatible in scale, materials, proportions and details with existing historic structures.*



- *Design an addition that is compatible with but subtly different from existing historic homes in the district.*
- *Design an addition so that if removed in the future, the historic building's form and character-defining features are not obscured, damaged, or destroyed.*

*The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation recommend the following:*

- *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.*
- *New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*

**THE MODIFICATION IS THAT THE ADDITION BE RELOCATED TO THE REAR OF THE MAIN STRUCTURE.**

Chairman Sevigny, Vice-Chairwoman Hamilton and Commissioners Esper, Mowles, Palacios, and Lopez commented.

Ray Marquez, contractor, responded to comments and questions from Commissioners.

Roberto Carrillo Arteaga, property owner, responded to comments and questions from Commissioners.

**MOTION:**

Motion made by Chairman Sevigny, seconded by Commissioner Luciano **AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THIS ITEM WITH THE FOLLOWING MODIFICATIONS:**

- 1. AS NOTED BEFORE, THE LINTELS OF THE WINDOWS AND DOORS WILL BE PAINTED RED TO MATCH THE EXISTING;**
- 2. THE FRENCH DOORS CONTAIN RECTANGULAR GLAZING;**
- 3. THE ROOF WILL BE COMPOSED OF RED MINERAL SURFACE ROLLED ROOFING;**
- 4. THERE WILL BE AT LEAST ONE FOOT SETBACK ON WEST ELEVATION;**
- 5. THE ENTIRE ADDITION CAN BE MOVED EAST TO ACCOMMODATE THE SETBACK;**
- 6. THERE BE AN ADDITIONAL RECOMMENDATION, NOT A REQUIREMENT, TO PLANT CYPRESS TREES ON THE WEST ELEVATION; AND**
- 7. THE RAILING ON THE COVERED PORCH WOULD MIMIC THE IRONWORK ON THE MAIN HOUSE**





4. Addresses of property HLC Commissioners have requested that HLC staff review or investigate and provide a report to the HLC. If no addresses are submitted in advance and listed under this agenda item, Commissioners may announce such addresses under this agenda item. Discussion on property announced at this meeting will take place during the next regularly scheduled meeting. November 19, 2018 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled at the December 3, 2018 meeting. December 3, 2018 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled for the December 17, 2018 meeting.

No requests were made by Commissioners.

**HLC Staff Report**

5. Update on Administrative Review Cases since last HLC meeting for the properties listed on the attachment posted with this agenda. (See Attachment "A.")

Vice-Chairwoman Hamilton commented on the property located at 215 N. Stanton Street. She suggested that the lights not be approved until the mural is modified to meet the criteria agreed upon.

Chairman Sevigny and Commissioners Lopez, Macias, Mowles, and Stapler commented.

Ms. Velázquez suggested Commissioners request staff issue a stop work order for the installation of lights at 215 N. Stanton Street.

***MOTION:***

Motion made by Vice-Chairwoman Hamilton, seconded by Commissioner Stapler ***AND CARRIED TO DIRECT STAFF TO ISSUE A STOP WORK ORDER UNTIL THE ISSUES WITH THE DEVIATION OF COLOR AND EXECUTION OF THE MURAL ARE RESOLVED.***

***ABSTAIN: Commissioner Mowles***

***RECUSAL: Commissioner Luciano***





Commissioner Stapler referred to case **PHHR18-000185-506 W. Yandell Drive, Don Luciano (owner)** Contributing Property – A request was made for removal of original wood windows and replacement with metal-clad operable windows to match existing (includes 1/1, 7/1, three light casement, a double-leaf 1/1 casement, and single pane awning windows) and removal of metal security bars.

Commissioner Stapler noted Commissioner Luciano was the property owner and requested Commissioners vote on this particular request individually.

***MOTION:***

Motion made by Chairman Sevigny, seconded by Vice-Chairwoman Hamilton ***AND CARRIED TO APPROVE THE ADMINISTRATIVE REVIEWS WITH THE ADDITION OF THE STOP WORK ORDER FOR 215 N STATION STREET.***

***ABSTAIN: Commissioners Mowles***

***RECUSAL: Commissioner Luciano***

**Other Business – Discussion and Action**

6. Discussion and action on Regular meeting minutes for November 5, 2018.

***MOTION:***

Motion made by Commissioner4 Luciano, seconded by Chairman Sevigny ***AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE AS THEY ARE.***

***ABSTAIN: Commissioner Stapler***

7. Discussion and action on the amendments to Chapter 20.20 of the El Paso City Code

Ms. Velázquez provided updates on the amendments to Chapter 20.20 for Commissioners.

***MOTION:***

Motion made by Chairman Sevigny, seconded by Commissioner Luciano ***AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADJOURN AT 5:32 P.M.***